

Staff Report of Findings

Application for Certificate of Appropriateness - Bonsall-Taylor House

Property Address: 2728 S Manito Boulevard
Applicant: Steve and Debby Dodds, owners
Hearing Date: 7/21/2021
Type of Work: SRHP Property Window Replacement

FINDINGS OF FACT:

1.) The Landmarks Commission has the authority to review this proposal for Certificate of Appropriateness.

- Under [SMC 4.35.080Bd](#), the commission has the authority to “Review proposals (as provided in [SMC 17D.100.200](#)) to construct, change, alter, modify, remodel, move, demolish and significantly affect properties or districts on the register.”
- SMC 17D.100.200 C sets forth in [Table 17D.100-1](#) the types of work to be reviewed by the full commission, which includes replacement of windows.

2.) The home at 2728 S Manito Boulevard was listed on the Spokane Register of Historic Places on 9/14/2015 by the current owners. The [Management Agreement](#) was signed August 19th, 2015 and has been recorded as a Notice of Management Agreement on the deed of the property. The Bonsall-Taylor House is listed on the Spokane Register of Historic Places under Category C – for a *property that embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.*

3.) There have been two separate approved Special Valuation applications on the property in 2015 (\$103,426) and in 2018 (\$171,234) for a total of \$274,660 in reduction in value resulting in a reduced property tax.

4.) The Management Standards for Spokane Register properties are the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings ([17D.100.210 D2](#) as well as on the signed [Management Agreement](#)). Staff recommendation is based on the Standards and Guidelines as listed below.

PROPOSED WORK:

The project is for the replacement of 8 existing wood windows with vinyl replacement windows. In addition, three original windows on the east façade (primary) are proposed to be replaced with new wood windows. The primary east façade’s original windows are all operable, however wood replacement windows are shown as two fixed flanking windows and one operable center window.

RELEVANT STANDARDS:

Standard Number 2: The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

- The Bonsall-Taylor House is listed on the Spokane Register of Historic Places under Category C – as a property that embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction. From the nomination document:

ORIGINAL APPEARANCE & MODIFICATIONS

*Much of the Bonsall-Taylor House is remarkably intact and reveals its original 1920 bungalow house form, exterior and interior design, “double course” wood shingle siding, workmanship, **windows**, exterior and interior doors, woodwork, fireplace, built-ins, and original lathe-and-plaster interior construction.*

- The Bonsall-Taylor House is noteworthy for its “remarkably intact” exterior features including the original windows are a noted feature when the property was nominated in 2015.
- Following is a staff assessment of whether the proposed windows meet the Secretary’s Standard #2:
 - This proposal is to remove some of the original windows of the property – the original wood windows are a key, character-defining feature of the building. This does not meet Standard #2.
 - This proposal seeks to replace three operable 1:1 wood windows on the second floor of the front façade with wood replacement windows. The replacement windows consist of one operable wood window (center) and two flanking wood windows which are fixed and have no sash. This does not meet Standard #2 as it both replaces original materials and alters a primary feature of the window configuration on the front façade by visually and operationally changing the 1:1 sash of the historic and operable existing windows.

Standard Number 5: Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

- Bungalow form elements and Craftsman-style features found on the Bonsall-Taylor House include the following (*from the 2015 Spokane Register Nomination*):
 - Built during the Craftsman style period, 1905-1930
 - Low-slung house form with a low-pitched roof and horizontal design emphasis
 - Full-width covered front porch
 - Thick square porch piers
 - Widely overhanging eaves
 - Deep bargeboards
 - Exposed rafters
 - Prominent horizontal lines found in “double course” small- and large-exposure alternating wood shingle siding
 - Natural building materials—wood shingle siding, wood tongue-in-groove soffits, brass door and window hardware, square-cut unembellished Craftsman-style

- woodwork, oak and fir floors, built-in bookcases with glass doors, original built-in kitchen cupboards/cabinets
 - **Original 1:1 double-hung, wood-sash windows**
 - Horizontal rows “ribbons” of multiple windows
 - Artistic Prairie-style influenced mortise-and-tenon geometric detail at top of front
 - porch piers
- Following is a staff assessment of whether the proposed windows meet the Secretary’s Standard #5:
 - Standard #5 requires that “distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques” be preserved. This proposal does not preserve the original windows of the house which are distinctive features and materials and therefore does not meet Standard #5.

Standard Number 6: Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

- Design Review Committee members, Austin Dickey and Daniel Zapotocky, joined Historic Preservation Office staff members, Historic Preservation Officer Megan Duvall and Historic Preservation Specialist Logan Camporeale for a site visit to observe the windows slated for replacement on July 7, 2021 at 4 pm. Property owner, Debby Dodds, showed the group the specific windows which have been applied.
- While there were some cracked panes and frayed/broken pull ropes, the windows in general seemed to be in a repairable condition.
- The proposed replacement window include two different types: the bulk of the replacement windows are of a vinyl material. Three primary façade 2nd story window is proposed to be wood.
 - The only windows being proposed for a wood replacement window are on the primary east façade. The existing windows are three operable 1:1 windows with a 40% upper sash and 60% lower sash. There is a large central window flanked by two smaller, vertically oriented operable windows.
 - The replacement wood Pella windows are one operable center window of the proper proportions, but the two flanking windows are proposed as fixed single pane windows, changing the character of the façade.
 - All other proposed replacements are for vinyl units that do not match the original in texture, visual qualities, or materials.
- Following is a staff assessment of whether the proposed window replacement meets the Secretary’s Standard #6:
 - Standard #6 requires that deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. This project does not meet Standard #6 because the condition of the existing, historic wood windows have not been considered for repair, just replacement.
 - Removing durable historic building materials and replacing them with materials perceived as more sustainable, such as vinyl double paned windows, is not recommended in the Illustrated Guidelines on Sustainability for Rehabilitating

Historic Buildings guidance published by the National Park Service (<https://www.nps.gov/tps/standards/rehabilitation/sustainability-guidelines.pdf>).

- For sustainability and energy consumption, the Guidelines recommend installing interior or exterior storm windows or panels that are compatible with existing historic windows (page 4; <https://www.nps.gov/tps/standards/rehabilitation/sustainability-guidelines.pdf>).
- Several of the existing windows do have storm windows. Prior photos of the house (when listed) show storm windows on most of the windows that are proposed for replacement – some have since been removed.
- The project does not meet Standard #6 in that it does not address repairs of the existing windows, only replacement.
- The proposed new vinyl windows (if the Commission felt that the windows were deteriorated beyond repair) do not match the old in texture, visual qualities, or material; thus the project does not meet Standard #6.
- The proposed new wood windows on the front façade do not meet Standard #6 because the operation and visual interest of the new windows do not match the old in design or visual qualities with two fixed, non-sashed windows flanking a central 1:1 sashed window.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Deny the application as the proposal calls for the replacement of wood windows with vinyl windows. Staff does not feel that the window survey adequately showed that the original windows cannot be reasonably repaired. Further, the wood replacement windows on the primary façade do not match the historic configuration of three operable windows. The project does not meet The Secretary of the Interior's Standards #2, #5 and #6.

Since the applicant purchased the windows without first obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness from the SHLC (as is stated as required on the Management Agreement, signed by the applicant and the City on the 19th of August, 2015 and approved as OPR 2015-0791 by the City Council); the Commission may choose to discuss the following alternatives at the public hearing on July 21, 2021:

1. Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness based upon Secretary's Standards.
2. Deny the Certificate of Appropriateness based on the staff recommendations.
3. Deny the Certificate of Appropriateness, with conditions. Condition would be to waive the Certificate of Appropriateness in order for the applicant to proceed with a building permit, which will create the following conditions:
 - a. This will allow applicant to decide if they would like to move forward with replacing the original windows with vinyl and wood windows that do not meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards.
 - b. If the applicant moves forward with window replacement, the next step would be for the SHLC to consider the removal of the Bonsall-Taylor House from the Spokane Register of Historic Places because it would no longer meet the criteria under which it was listed – Category C.
 - c. The property has been granted two separate Special Valuation tax incentives totaling

\$274,660. The HP Office would inform the Spokane County Tax Assessor to collect back taxes including penalties and interest (as stated in the [Washington Administrative Code](#)).

4. The Commission may discuss other alternatives with the applicant during the public hearing.

HPO Report – Megan Duvall
Design Review Committee Review: Zapotocky, Dickey
Landmarks Commission Review: Pending

Date: 7/12/21
Site Visit: 7/7/21
Hearing Date: 7/21/21